

**BOARD OF FORESTRY AND FIRE PROTECTION**

P.O. Box 944246  
SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460  
Website: [www.bof.fire.ca.gov](http://www.bof.fire.ca.gov)  
(916) 653-8007



## **RANGE MANAGEMENT ADVISORY COMMITTEE** **MEETING MINUTES**

### **Meeting Announcement and Agenda**

**Posting Date:** Wednesday, March 15, 2023

**Meeting Date:** Monday, March 27, 2023, 12:30 PM

### **Location:**

RMAC Meeting was hosted via teleconference, as authorized pursuant to Government Code section 11133. In addition to the teleconference, members of the Range Management Advisory Committee or anyone from the interested public was able to attend at the following physical location:

California Natural Resources Agency Headquarters: 715 P Street, Sacramento, CA 95814, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Room 310

The meeting was also observable via webcast by completing registration at the following weblink:

### **Webinar Registration Link:**

<https://attendee.gotowebinar.com/register/2850214944288833369>

### **ROLL CALL**

#### **RMAC Members Present**

Chair, Dr. Marc Horney – virtual  
Vice Chair, Rich Ross – in person  
Joel Kramer – virtual  
Cole Bush – virtual  
Bart Cremers – in person  
Lance Criley – virtual  
Katie Delbar, ex officio member – virtual  
Taylor Hagata – in person  
Dr. Stephanie Larson – virtual

#### **RMAC Members Absent**

Dr. Paul Starrs  
Billie Roney  
Andrée Soares

*The Board's mission is to lead California in developing policies and programs that serve the public interest in environmentally, economically, and socially sustainable management of forest and rangelands, and a fire protection system that protects and serves the people of the state.*

**RMAC Staff**

Dr. Kristina Wolf, Environmental Scientist – in person

**Department Staff**

Steven He, Technical Support – in person

**Public Attendees** – Jacob Dixon, Michael Garabedian, Jeanette Griffin, Max Hylaris, Ben Munger, Shannon Rich, Brian Shobe, and Benjamin Waitman

---

**AGENDA ITEMS:** [RMAC Agenda online \(https://bof.fire.ca.gov/media/ybwnpys5/02-march-27-2023-agenda-final.pdf\)](https://bof.fire.ca.gov/media/ybwnpys5/02-march-27-2023-agenda-final.pdf)

Items are numbered by their corresponding Number on the agenda and documented below in order of their introduction during the meeting.

**1. Call to Order, Webinar Meeting Format, and Roll Call – Dr. Kristina Wolf, Board Staff**

See results of roll call, above. Dr. Wolf reviewed the webinar format and functionality.

→ **Skipped to Agenda Item #3**

**3. Approval of February 2023 meeting minutes – Dr. Wolf, Board Staff**

The draft meeting minutes were sent out to the RMAC members for their review. There were no corrections required.

Member Hagata motioned to approve the February meeting minutes as presented; Member Ross seconded the motion.

**Roll Call Vote:**

Bush	Aye
Kramer	Aye
Cremers	Aye
Delbar	Aye
Dr. Larson	Absent at time of vote
Criley	Aye
Ross	Aye
Hagata	Aye
Dr. Horney	Aye

The motion passes unanimously by majority vote with nine ayes; the meeting minutes are posted online: [February 2023 Meeting Minutes \(https://bof.fire.ca.gov/media/e2woexyx/01-february-23-2023-meeting-minutes-final\\_ada.pdf\)](https://bof.fire.ca.gov/media/e2woexyx/01-february-23-2023-meeting-minutes-final_ada.pdf)

**4. Reappointment of RMAC member(s) and Election of Chair and Vice Chair – Dr. Wolf, Board Staff**

**Reappointment of Bart Cremers**

Originally Member Cremers joined the RMAC as a representative of the Farm Bureau Federation, but he is no longer with the Farm Bureau, and now works for Wildlands, Inc. Per the Board’s executive officer, Member Cremers can still remain on as a member representing rangeland organizations that represent rangeland owners if the committee votes to have him reappointed. Member Cremers agreed that he would stay in this seat if re-elected.

***Voting Record for reappointment***

Member Ross motioned to reappoint Member Cremers to his seat as a representative of rangeland organizations representing rangeland owners for another four-year term; Member Hagata seconded the motion.

**Roll Call Vote:**

Bush	Aye
Kramer	Aye
Cremers	Aye
Dr. Larson	Aye – joined meeting after initial roll call
Criley	Aye
Ross	Aye
Hagata	Aye
Dr. Horney	Aye

The motion passes unanimously with eight ayes.

**Appointment of Chair and Vice-Chair**

Member Horney agreed to stay on as chair if re-elected.

Member Larson indicated her interest in running for Vice-Chair. Dr. Larson would take the place of Member Rich Ross if elected. Member Ross indicated his willingness to continue as Vice Chair, but does not feel the need to run if Dr. Larson will run for this seat. Member Ross then indicated that he would step down, and would not run for the seat of Vice-Chair for another year.

***Voting Record for Appointments of Chair and Vice-Chair***

Member Hagata motioned to reappoint Member Horney to his seat as Chair, and to appoint Dr. Larson to the Vice-Chair seat; Member Bush seconded the motion.

**Roll Call Vote:**

Bush	Aye
Kramer	Aye
Cremers	Aye
Dr. Larson	Aye
Criley	Aye
Ross	Aye
Hagata	Aye
Dr. Horney	Aye

The motion passes unanimously with eight ayes.

The reappointment of Member Cremers to a seat on the RMAC, to Member Horney as the Chair, and Member Larson as the Vice-Chair will be submitted to the Board to confirm these appointments at its May 11<sup>th</sup> meeting.

**➔ *Returned to Agenda Item #2***

**2. Staff/Chairman’s report – Dr. Marc Horney, *Chair***

Dr. Horney provided an update on several items in motion:

- Dr. Horney reported that he and Board staff Dr. Wolf have been working on planning the annual educational series.

- Dr. Horney provided a short update to the Board at the March 8<sup>th</sup> Board meeting on the major efforts of the RMAC and they approved the 2022 Annual Report & Workplan.
- Board of Forestry & Fire Protection ('Board') Chair Gilles asked Dr. Horney about the role of external organizations like UC Cooperative Extension, CA Rangeland Conservation Coalition, and others in addressing the public education needs, rather than the RMAC. Dr. Horney stated that one of RMAC's proper roles is to identify and bring to public attention issues that are not already a part of active public discourse and/or are not receiving appropriate recognition in agency policies. The RMAC brings those to the table for discussion and brainstorming on the appropriate entities to address them, and once those issues receive sufficient awareness and resources, the RMAC would ultimately hand these issues off to those entities as appropriate.

→ **Resumed Agenda with Agenda Item #5**

**5. Assignment and Planning for Annual Priorities – Dr. Horney, Chair**

RMAC member assignments to individual objectives were provided to members in March, and no members requested changes to the assignments. The assignments are available online in table format: [https://bof.fire.ca.gov/media/yq3j0yyd/4-rmac-objective-assignments-2023-03-22\\_ada.pdf](https://bof.fire.ca.gov/media/yq3j0yyd/4-rmac-objective-assignments-2023-03-22_ada.pdf). Dr. Horney walked through the first rows of objectives to ensure that members were aware of and committed to the objective assignments, and then clarified that all the members have received this document. Dr. Horney requested that members contact Dr. Wolf within 48 hours if they would like to see any changes to the objective assignments.

Member Bush mentioned addressing the prescribed herbivory white paper should be part of Objective 1b. Dr. Wolf noted there is a separate item for that. Member Bush clarified that this is the part of the task that she can commit to. Member Kramer also indicated that he could be added to any items with associations with RCDs.

**State Lands Grazing License and Land Management** sub-committee: Member Ross noted that he and Member Cremers are satisfied that the contractual elements of the grazing license template are ready for final review by DGS; he noted that the Grazing Management Plan needs more work, but that he doesn't think DGS needs to even see this component; while the Grazing license template is tied to the Grazing Management Plan template, it isn't necessarily contractually binding in the same way that the license is, so perhaps we could move forward on DGS review of the license. Dr. Wolf will let DGS know the license is ready for their review, and when they are ready to review it, she will send it. Jeanette Griffin noted that it was her recollection that the Grazing Management Plan (GMP) was ready for final review as well. Dr. Wolf noted some potentially outstanding comments in the GMP.

The full 2022 Annual Report and Workplan is also posted online:

[https://bof.fire.ca.gov/media/o3ilsgv1/rmac-2022-annual-report-and-workplan-final\\_ada.pdf](https://bof.fire.ca.gov/media/o3ilsgv1/rmac-2022-annual-report-and-workplan-final_ada.pdf)

**6. Update on Working Group or Advised Agency liaisons – Dr. Wolf, Board staff**

**Fish and Game Commission (Commission) and Board Joint Policy on Hardwoods**

[https://bof.fire.ca.gov/media/yvtej2ji/6-joint-hardwood-board-policy-1994\\_ada.pdf](https://bof.fire.ca.gov/media/yvtej2ji/6-joint-hardwood-board-policy-1994_ada.pdf)

- The Management Committee (MC), a standing committee of the Board, meeting at which JPH was to be discussed was put off until April, and then again until May, so any comments may be provided either by attending the meeting, formally submitting comments by following the instructions in the Board agenda online, or by sending comments to Dr. Wolf by no later

than Friday April 24th, who would provide them to the MC. The next discussion in the MC will be May 11<sup>th</sup> at the Board meeting in San Diego. Dr. Wolf suggested that the RMAC write a letter, or members do so, if they desire. There were a few emailed comments to Dr. Wolf from RMAC members, and in general, the comments she received could be summarized as: "Define 'Hardwood Rangeland' and the tree/shrub species that are included."

- Member Cremers agreed with that general suggestion, and also noted that this policy is not regulation and was actually set up to avoid regulation.
- Member Ross stated that this policy was developed 20 years ago, and thus far nobody has identified a need to have this policy, so why have it? Is there a need for it? A general statement that all hardwoods should be protected is too simplistic.
- Chair Horney: Should RMAC submit a letter, or will you submit your own comments?
- Chair Horney: It sounds like certain hardwood species in particular locations are the concern, not just species on their own. Thus, by making a very general rule to protect them all, this interferes with good, reasonable land management that strikes a balance between fuels management and wildlife habitat management.

### ***Letter to the Management Committee***

It is suggested that the RMAC submit a letter on the JPH to the MC.

### ***Voting Record for Letter to the Management Committee on the JPH***

Member Ross motioned that the RMAC write a letter on the JPH to the MC; Member Criley seconded the motion.

### **Roll Call Vote:**

Bush	Aye
Kramer	Aye
Cremers	Aye
Dr. Larson	Aye
Criley	Aye
Ross	Aye
Hagata	Aye
Dr. Horney	Aye

The motion passes unanimously with eight ayes. Chair Horney and the Vice-Chair Larson would write this letter by April 21.

### **Natural & Working Lands Team**

Dr. Wolf provided an update on her interactions with the Natural & Working Lands (NWL) team under the Natural Resources Agency (CNRA). Dr. Wolf has made two recommendations thus far for tribal representatives to join the Expert Advisory Committee (EAC), and if others have any recommendations they can send them to Dr. Wolf, or to Clesi Bennett or Jenn Phillips with CNRA. Dr. Wolf also provided information on the next NWL EAC meeting on March 28th. This meeting, which is open to members of the public, will be a virtual event from 12:00–5:00 PM on Tuesday, March 28th. Meetings and members will be subject to Bagley-Keene Opening Meeting Act requirements. Register here:

[https://teams.microsoft.com/registration/UIYdt4NLV0KvzX\\_Rd4hFZA,bBVarhTOHEWKebZs2Y-bEA,WseG5Ztf7EmdjnPjPMNk50A,1TXB7XUGxUSu57a0w7kvqg.gz2RjdSOTk2cDOEux7GNfA,b2-yWN7i1UCWEcm\\_nQXvEQ?mode=read&tenantId=b71d5652-4b83-4257-afcd-7fd177884564&webinarRing=gcc](https://teams.microsoft.com/registration/UIYdt4NLV0KvzX_Rd4hFZA,bBVarhTOHEWKebZs2Y-bEA,WseG5Ztf7EmdjnPjPMNk50A,1TXB7XUGxUSu57a0w7kvqg.gz2RjdSOTk2cDOEux7GNfA,b2-yWN7i1UCWEcm_nQXvEQ?mode=read&tenantId=b71d5652-4b83-4257-afcd-7fd177884564&webinarRing=gcc). The agenda can be found here: <https://resources.ca.gov/>

[/media/CNRA-Website/Files/Initiatives/Expanding-Nature-Based-Solutions/MARCH-28-AGENDA\\_AB-1757-Natural-and-Working-Lands-Expert-Advisory-Committee.pdf](/media/CNRA-Website/Files/Initiatives/Expanding-Nature-Based-Solutions/MARCH-28-AGENDA_AB-1757-Natural-and-Working-Lands-Expert-Advisory-Committee.pdf)

Meeting materials and video recordings for the February 8<sup>th</sup> meeting, and all NWL EAC meetings, may be accessed on the CNRA webpage for this endeavor.

Jenn Phillips at CNRA reached out to Dr. Wolf today to ask if the RMAC has any information on existing goals, policies, or targets in place for grasslands or rangelands. This is related to efforts in the state to develop implementation goals for different ecosystems, including rangelands. We have discussed this as well in the past in the context of the Dept of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) Healthy Soils Initiative, but that effort was put on hold by CDFA, and they may redirect their efforts in a different way. The CNRA implementation targets are related to AB 1757 and the 5<sup>th</sup> CA Climate Change Assessment. Dr. Wolf requested that if anyone has knowledge of any existing targets that could be shared with the NWL EAC, please let her know.

### **Wildfire & Forest Resilience Task Force (Task Force)**

The RMAC has discussed the possibility of having an RMAC member represent or otherwise engage with the Task Force. Chair Horney has interacted with the Task Force in the past. It is chiefly made up among insurance companies discussing how they will deal with insurance in the high wildfire risk zones, and he did not feel that there was much to discuss related to the RMAC at this stage, but it could head that direction in the future. Chair Horney will take responsibility for dropping in on their meetings and will send a summary to the members to see if there is anywhere that an RMAC member could interact in a usual way.

More information can be found online: <https://wildfiretaskforce.org/>

## **7. Educational Workshop Series Planning Update – Dr. Horney, *Chair* and Dr. Wolf, *Board staff***

Dr. Wolf reviewed the progress and status made towards the 2022/23 Annual Educational Series:

### ***Webinars***

- 1) Request For Proposals (RFP) Workshop Joint Range Conference with the California Rangeland Conservation Coalition (CRCC) tomorrow, Feb 24, in Stockton: <https://spranch.calpoly.edu/navigating-proposal-process-wildfire-fuels-treatment-using-prescribed-grazing>. Speakers included:
  - Dr. Marc Horney, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo: Making your Case - Important Elements to Consider in Developing Proposals for Funding Grazing Treatments for Fuels Removal
  - Dr. Stephanie Larson, UC Cooperative Extension (UCCE): How to Implement Grazing into a Vegetation Management Plan.
  - Marshall Turbeville, CAL FIRE: Grazing to reduce wildfire intensity, rate of spread, and resistance to control
  - Ryan Nielsen & Clayton Koopmann: Grazer perspectives on developing and applying for grazing projects
- 2) Grazing License – Will happen on May 19<sup>th</sup>; virtual only workshop. Right now it will be Julea Shaw (Department of Fish & Wildlife), Lisa Worthington (CalTrans), Marc Horney, Len Nielsen (CAL FIRE), and maybe a representative from the Department of General Services.

- 3) Management Plan –Still trying to pin down a planning meeting date, will probably be June 8<sup>th</sup>; speakers will be Alan Bower (NRCS), Morgan Doran (UCCE), Sheila Barry (UCCE), and Roxanne Foss (Vollmar Natural Lands Consulting, VNLC)

### **Field Tours**

- 1) East Bay Regional Parks District (EBRPD) – occurred March 16<sup>th</sup>, <https://spranch.calpoly.edu/targeted-grazing-fuel-reduction-case-studies-east-bay-regional-parks>.
  - Sheep, goats, and cattle representatives were present; the goal was to help participants improve their understanding of why people might choose targeted grazing as part of a vegetation management and fuels reduction strategy, and how that gets implemented.
  - Speakers included Fuels Reduction Coordinator at EBRPD, Steve Keller; Rangeland Specialist at EBRPD, Allison Rofe; Star Creek Land Stewards', Bianca Soares; and CAL FIRE representatives, among others.
- 2) A second Field Day is likely to be a combination of the Cal-Pac SRM Spring Field Tour and RMAC Field Day. Will occur May 8 at Rancho Jamul and Hollenbeck Canyon Wildlife Area beginning at 8:30 AM. Speakers will include representatives from UC Berkeley, UCCE, Vollmar Natural Lands Consulting, US Geological Survey, and the CA Dept of Fish & Wildlife.
- 3) Paso Robles – Salinas River: planning in process; speakers are likely to include Beth Reynolds, Cal Poly SLO & the Goat Girls; Jay Enns, Paso Fire Department; LynneDee Althouse & Meade (A&M); Katie Brown, A&M; Daniel Keeley, A&M; Dan Turner, San Luis Obispo Fire Safe Council
- 4) Ojai Valley Field Day – planning in process; speakers are likely to include Cole Bush, Shepherdess Land & Livestock; Michael Leicht, Ventura Brush Goats; Matthew Shapero, UCCE; Chris Danch, Ojai Valley FSC; and Tom Maloney, Brendan Taylor, and/or Vivon Crawford, Ojai Land Conservancy

### **8. State Lands Grazing License & Land Management (SLGLLM) sub-Committee Update – SLGLLM members and Dr. Horney, Chair**

Dr. Wolf initially reported that the SLGLLM draft documents have not been revised since summer 2022 and are still in draft stage; any members that would like to volunteer to help move this process forward would be much appreciated. This item was also discussed in Agenda Item #5, so see above for details on that discussion.

Dr. Wolf will share the current Grazing License template with DGS, and Member Ross and Member Cremers will work with DGS to finalize that document. There are a lot of comments still outstanding in the Grazing Management Plan; the Chair will try to address all comments and send back to Dr. Wolf a week from Wednesday.

Member Delbar indicated that she and Tracy Schohr still need to get the Booklet done, but if the other two documents are buttoned up, then they can better move forward on this. She will connect with Tracy on this.



## 9. Range Management Workforce Development Grant, “Range School” Discussion – Dr. Horney, *Chair* and Recording - Dr. Susan Marshall, *Cal Poly Humboldt*

At the February meeting Chair Horney reviewed Dr. Marshall’s slides, and Dr. Marshall’s recording was shared in the chat: <https://screenpal.com/watch/c0n0qJVyyMd>

Chair Horney provided a brief summary of these efforts, and status.

- The RMAC has had several interactions with US Forest Service staff that have had ongoing issues with finding qualified candidates to fill Range Management Specialist positions. Within the Society for Range Management (SRM), academics have been working to come up with a solution to this workforce issue.
- Dr. Marshall and Dr. Horney have been working on this workforce development challenge, including attempts to recruit high school students into the range sciences. They have also worked to set up coordinated training programs in their universities and other institutions to develop candidates at the federal level (for federal GS-0454 designations), and they are now attempting to translate that process for the state certification—the California Certified Range Manager (CRM)—to satisfy the basic requisites for individuals to qualify to take that exam.
- They have conducted surveys at the SRM meeting and at the CRCC meeting this year to assess how they might best address the above needs.

### ***Member Discussion***

Member Cole: has a lot of interest in seeing how these efforts would apply to a community college trade school type of setting, as well as at 4-year universities; where can the ‘trade’ workforce fit in, given the many gaps for training in the prescribed grazing field?

Chair Horney: This is still early phase and while they know what courses they need to deliver, they don’t have a clear plan yet for satisfying all of them; at the federal level, they need one set of courses; the CRM needs another set (there is some overlap). What Member Bush is talking about also would require more basic skills to go into the field at all, and that might not require the same set of classes, but another set. So Chair Horney thinks that ideas from Member Bush and the Grazing School of the West could have some useful input.

Member Hagata: Adjustments have been made to how employees are paid at the federal level to make it more enticing, and hopefully that helps. The Tahoe region has had issues finding range specialists. Feather River College might be a good partner/source for training.

Chair Horney: Pelayo is a contact at Feather River College; Shasta college is another potential source, as well as at the college in Sonoma (Member Larson is teaching there).

Dr. Wolf: I hear a lot about there “not being enough CRMs”, and also the comment that “there’s no reason for there to be more CRMs”. Is the need really just more for rangeland expertise, or is it CRMs explicitly?

Dr. Horney: He believes it is more the need for more people with training on rangelands, training and understanding of grazing animals and ecosystem impacts/management and prescribed burning, along with other vegetation management tools. Grazing is only ONE of the tools that can be used for fuel reduction treatments in California. The CRM license is required by certain entities for grazing to occur in forested areas. Is CRM necessary? Rarely limited geographic scope! But it



is useful, especially if they have a lot of rangeland management including grazing. To hire a federal rangeland specialist, candidates must have at least 18 semester hours in range courses, and that is a high bar. Not many opportunities for students in California to do that; Humboldt was the only university that was ever able to provide that, although Cal Poly SLO is now heading in that direction. But for a CRM, you don't need that. The bar is much lower in terms of academic history for a CRM. To understand rangeland ecology and management of grazing animals is also important, but you don't need to

Member Criley: in terms of the CRM, that is an early/mid-career step (it does require work experience to even qualify). So often once a person has the work experience, they are past the early/mid-career state; but once they are past that, they aren't going to go back to school to get that academic credit.

Dr. Wolf: Many folks will have the academic credits but not the work experience, and if you have the work experience you are often old enough that you aren't going back to school.

Member Criley: the CRM panel can recommend workshops and other ways to gain the academic requisites though.

Dr. Wolf: Individuals already working full time jobs may not have the time to gain those credits, despite already having PLENTY of experience to pass the CRM exam.

Member Bush: Regarding practitioners who have a lot of training and experience, a lot of the work is just understanding the operations; for individuals early on in the training process, there is more and more interest as they grow in their experiences in ecological processes and management. The opportunity for upwards mobility as a CRM (when not coming in from academia) could be bolstered, and pathways could be created for those folks who have a ton of expertise but less so in terms of academics/coursework to still have upward mobility.

Public Comment from Jacob Dixon – NRCS, recent Cal Poly graduate. Dr. Gibson at UNR has a program that was originally developed for the 401 firefighter positions with BLM, but they have since been expanded to include the 0454 series – for that program, they look at your transcript and only enroll you in the courses you are missing, so then you are meeting the requirements. This is a new program. So Dr. Gibson might be a good person to have in this discussion.

Chair Horney: Yes, that is a new program that UNR just opened up. What Dr. Marshall and he are working on is a similar program, but they are prob 3–5 years out from a program like that, so he is pointing his students to Reno to get those qualifications in the meantime. So they want to build a bridge for students in CA or wherever they are coming from to have a pathway to get into the rangeland career field.

#### **10. Planning for Integration of Prescribed Herbivory for Fuels Treatments White Paper – Dr. Wolf, Board staff**

Dr. Wolf summarized the plans to update the Prescribed Herbivory white paper to include new information on:

- Grazing and integration alone or in combination with other treatments
- Guidance
- Data gaps/research needs

Chair Horney: He remembers that this would have more of an emphasis on other treatments being integrated into and alongside other fuels treatments, and this would be an update to the 2015 white paper.

Member Bush: Grazing operators have experience working alongside CAL FIRE or other fire ecologists and personnel, and she is seeing more and more that there is increasing integration and collaboration among livestock managers and fire managers. The white paper should have educational components that can meet the needs of a very wide audience, from new practitioners to seasoned and experienced managers. It is a great crossover and opportunity to update the white paper to include these other approaches.

Chair Horney: He hopes it comes out as 1) what we know now, and 2) what we still need to know.

Member Bush: It would be really helpful if we had some pilots and demonstrations that could be case studies for these different approaches.

Dr. Wolf clarified: Is the intention is to update the white paper with the above information, followed by a new publication that is more of a technical guidance?

Chair Horney: the original white paper was written specifically for fuels mitigation; he leaves it to Member Bush as to the content.

Member Bush: initial opinion is that there should be two separate documents, possibly formatted in different ways, with the first (updated white paper) being more of a primer on the topic with new information and case studies, and the second being more a technical guide or road map for developing and monitoring these kinds of projects, and guiding public interactions, outreach, and more. These additional assets would be something that the CWGA Targeted Grazing Committee also finds value in and is aiming to develop and provide to the public for technical guidance for rangeland management.

**Step 1:** go through and update the white paper that was previously published in 2015; include these other combinations approaches. What we have learned (case studies, new research and learning, new grants that are informing the process of these projects being developed, etc); what we know; where there are questions (data gaps).

**Step 2:** technical guidance paper/roadmap

The steps could be conducted concurrently, however, or at least partially. The white paper should likely be published prior to the guidance, because we will likely need additional expertise for the technical guidance paper from folks having experience with mastication, manual methods, etc, and will likely require more collaboration with additional assets.

In regards to the timeline, Member Bush stated

Dr. Wolf also reported that the initial pamphlet that was produced by the CWGA Targeted Grazing Committee and members of the RMAC was submitted to CAL FIRE personnel. She briefly described the pamphlet. While they have not yet agreed to put this into the CAL FIRE Fuels Reduction Guidance as an addendum or in future versions of the document. CAL FIRE personnel requested that the draft be put into CAL FIRE's format to match the 2021 Fuels Reduction Guidance.

Chair Horney inquired if students could contribute to the white paper via monitoring or conducting of case studies? Member Bush believes that yes, this would several goals of the RMAC and be very valuable. The RMAC website could host results from case studies.

## 11. Updates from Partner Organizations & Public Forum

### a. Legislative Updates

- Rich – we should be giving input to the advised agencies when it relates to rangelands, which includes grazing, fire, etc. Why aren't we tracking what the Air Board did re: chainsaws and other gas-powered engines? Depredation affects rangelands, so why aren't we tracking information on wolves? We should be kept up to date on these comments. Dr. Wolf mentioned AB 1346, and noted this topic has come up several times, and she asked how this should be addressed? Member Ross wants to know what is being contemplated by the Air Board in terms of developing regulations that would outlaw these things when it is feasible. Chair Horney: We would like to inquire about getting someone from the agency to come talk to RMAC about this issue. Dr. Wolf will reach out to the CA Air Resources Board about this.
- California Climate & Agriculture Network (CalCAN) - Carbon Cycle Institute recently came on as the 8th partner at CalCAN.
  - **SB 675 (Limón): Prescribed Grazing for Wildfire Mitigation** – Aims to advance prescribed grazing for wildfire reduction and fuels mitigation
    - Components:
      - Fire Prevention Grant Program
        - Adds outreach and education for prescribed grazing
        - Implementation assistance
        - Infrastructure support
          - Member Delbar – USDA deals with permanent infrastructure via NRCS/EQIP, they don't worry about it, the liability is on the producer.
      - Expert consultation for graziers
    - Regional Forest & Fire Capacity Program
    - Develop local prescribed grazing plans
    - Guidance on BMPs from RMAC and the UCCE
    - State Wildfire & Forest Resilience Task Force
      - Required to include prescribed grazing near communities
      - Expand scope of existing market development for fiber and meat (beyond biomass and forest materials).
  - Other Comments:
    - Member Ross: with the new definition of prescribed grazing, this bill excludes cattle.
      - Dr. Wolf: to clarify – there is no specification of livestock species.

- Chair Horney: could the RMAC come up with some terminology to make things species-neutral, to emphasize this prescribed grazing thing is species-independent in some way, and perhaps erode some of the bias against cattle?
- Member Bush: she has heard from legislative representatives that they want to use different kinds of terminology to help sway or prevent bias. Sheep and goats have been pigeon-holed in a lot of ways for prescribed grazing. Would it do our goals a disservice if we call it ecological grazing? Prescribed grazing IS ecologically-minded grazing. She wants to find a way to make this more inclusion.
- Rich: the bill doesn't explicitly exclude cattle, but it does say "including" sheep and but not "no limited to" this implies a constraint: in this case, one of four goals: 1) wildfire, 2) invasive species, 3) habitat, 4) biodiversity; so if one of those things isn't your goals, then you aren't doing "prescribed grazing" as defined by this bill. So that means any other animal is excluded, i.e., cattle.
  - Member Hagata and Dr. Wolf stated they didn't agree that cattle graziers only have one goal: production. Dr. Wolf pointed out that this bill is focused on wildfire, not species of livestock. At East Bay Regional Parks District, this IS being done with cattle, and NOT with sheep and goats. Perhaps there is more of a perception that cattle are excluded, but in reality, it is NOT.
- Chair Horney – has an idea about an article to write on this; will send to Rich and Cole and then to the rest of the committee. Wants to write an article about prescribed grazing and livestock, INCLUDING CATTLE.

## **b. Updates from Partner Organizations**

### **i. California Farm Bureau**

- Member Hagata reported that Farm Bureau is working with USFS on vacant grazing allotments, and with BLM on their new grazing plans.

### **ii. California Cattlemen's Association**

### **iii. University of California Cooperative Extension**

### **iv. California Wool Growers Association**

### **v. California Resource Conservation Districts (CA RCD)**

- CARCD is applying for a CDFA Healthy Soils block grant to distribute funds for Incentives Projects.
- Southern California Carbon Farming Hub received a CDFA Conservation Planning grant and projects will include two Audubon Habitat Management Plans and one Grazing Management Plan on ranches in San Diego County.

- Mapping report upcoming for change in area of grazing land in San Diego County before 1986 to the present.
- CARCD is holding a conference throughout March, including a dozen panels and presentations on Forest and Fire Resilience.

c. **Members of the public** may address the Committee on any topic within its jurisdiction not otherwise on the agenda. Items will not be discussed in depth but may be agendaized for the next committee meeting.

### Announcements

- The next Natural & Working Lands Expert Advisory Committee Meeting is March 28<sup>th</sup>
- EPA Grants Competition Process Webinar

The EPA Grants Competition Process Webinar will be held on Tuesday, March 28, from 2:00-3:00 pm ET. Join this webinar to learn how to find and successfully apply for EPA grants. Participants will be able to ask questions of EPA presenters during the webinar. Advance registration is required. Click here to register. If you have already registered, you should have received a confirmation email with the link to the webinar.

Presentation materials and a list of helpful links will be available on EPA's website before the webinar: <https://www.epa.gov/grants/competition-process-webinar-march-28-2023>. After the webinar, a recording will be posted to the same webpage.

- The State Water Board is meeting on April 4<sup>th</sup> to discuss the Implementation of Sustainable Groundwater Management Act.
- Public Comment, Mike Garabedian: what is the acreage (%) in California's 100+ million acres is being grazed for agricultural purposes?
  - Chair Horney thinks he might have SOME information that might be useful and he can share it with me. About 40% of the state is rangeland, but that depends on how lands are grouped.
- **NEXT MEETING: The suggested next meeting day is Thursday, May 16<sup>th</sup> at 12:30 PM.**
- Future topics that Dr. Wolf is looking to include at future meetings in some format (discussion, presentation/speaker) include: grazing in riparian zones, dozer operations during/post-fire, more. If there is something you want to see on the agenda, email Dr. Wolf.

### 12. Adjourn