

BOARD OF FORESTRY AND FIRE PROTECTION

P.O. Box 944246

SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2460

Website: www.bof.fire.ca.gov

(916) 653-8007

**Range Management Advisory Committee Meeting (RMAC)****Meeting Minutes****Meeting Date:** Tuesday, March 19, 2024, 12:30 PM**Primary Location:** California Natural Resources Agency Headquarters, 715 P Street, Sacramento, 95814, 2nd floor Conference Room 2-221A**Secondary Locations:**

- Star Creek Land Stewards, Inc. – 1232 California Avenue, Los Banos, 93635
- Cal Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo – Alan A. Erhart Agriculture Building, Building 10, Room 101, 1 Grand Avenue, San Luis Obispo, 93407
- UC Cooperative Extension Sonoma County – 133 Aviation Boulevard, Suite 109, Santa Rosa, 95403
- Resource Conservation District of Greater San Diego – 11769 Waterhill Road, Lakeside, CA 92040
- Ojai Valley Fire Safe Council – 201 Bryant St, Ojai, CA 93023

The meeting recording may be retained for a limited amount of time, and during that time, may be observed by completing registration at the following weblink. Access to the recording is not guaranteed at any given time. Please see the [May 19, 2024 Agenda](#) for further details.

Webinar Recording Access Link:

<https://register.gotowebinar.com/recording/7712282858461061727>

ROLL CALL**RMAC Members Present**

Chair, Dr. Marc Horney – in person at Cal Poly State University, San Luis Obispo

Vice-Chair, Dr. Stephanie Larson – in person at UCCE Sonoma County

Dr. Paul Starrs – in person at UCCE Sonoma County

Andrée Soares – in person at Star Creek Land Stewards

Katie Delbar, ex officio member – in person at California Natural Resources Agency Headquarters

Rich Ross – in person at California Natural Resources Agency Headquarters

Bart Cremers – in person at California Natural Resources Agency Headquarters

Joel Kramer – in person at Resource Conservation District of Greater San Diego

Cole Bush – in person at Ojai Valley Fire Safe Council

RMAC Members Absent

Lance Criley (virtual only)

The Board's mission is to lead California in developing policies and programs that serve the public interest in environmentally, economically, and socially sustainable management of forest and rangelands, and a fire protection system that protects and serves the people of the state.

Taylor Hagata
OPEN SEAT

Board Staff

Dr. Kristina Wolf, Environmental Scientist – virtual
Mazonika Kemp – virtual and in person
Deniele Cade – virtual

Department Staff

Steve Fountain, Technical Support – in person

Public Attendees (Virtual listed only)

Nina Bingham, Trevor Fox, Brian Judge, Mikie McDonnell, Hayley McGilvery, Victoria Mellott, Gary Montgomery, Ben Munger, Bryan Puleri, Samantha Tuleya

AGENDA ITEMS and MEETING MINUTES:

Items are numbered by their corresponding number on the agenda and documented below in order of their introduction during the meeting. [Video Recording Times](#) preceding each Agenda Item are approximate.

Approximate start time on video recording: 00:07:00

1. Call to Order, Webinar Meeting Format, and Roll Call – Dr. Wolf, Board Staff

Dr. Wolf reviewed webinar functionality and called the roll. A quorum was present.

2. Staff/Chairman's report – Dr. Marc Horney, Chair

State Budget

Dr. Wolf noted that RMAC members and Board staff do not have travel funding through Fiscal Year (FY) 2026 because the State budget has been frozen for non-essential travel, so there can be no field days without external, partner-provided funding to support travel or workshop needs. Because the RMAC would still like to conduct a couple of workshops in person, it will need feedback on potential partners for resources for funding, resources, and site hosts.

Action Item:

- RMAC Members or stakeholders can contact Dr. Wolf by [email](#) with information to support this effort.

Outcome of the SRM session on collaborative forestry and range management

This symposium was conducted in collaboration with partners from the RMAC and the SRM Prescribed Grazing Committee, of which a number of individuals spoke along with RMAC members Cole Bush, Dr. Horney, and RMAC staff Dr. Wolf. The recording of the full meeting has been released by the Society for Range Management.

Dr. Wolf indicated that the presenters that day had provided some resources that she has compiled for the attendees to this symposium. However, a sign-up sheet for that day was either not taken, or was lost, so at this time Dr. Wolf has been unable to share this with the attendees. She is hoping to get this resource list out to attendees that day, so if folks are aware of who attended that day, please let her know and she can forward that. Dr. Horney indicated he will contact SRM

leadership and get a notice added to the SRM Range Flash to have folks interested in this to contact Dr. Wolf.

Action Items:

- Dr. Wolf will finalize the resources list with input from the panel members.
- Dr. Horney will attempt to play the whole meeting back to record it, and the RMAC may post the recorded segment of for the symposium on the RMAC webpage.
- Dr. Horney will also check with SRM leadership to see if a notice can be added to the SRM range flashes about individuals interested in obtaining the resources list.
- Dr. Wolf will look into posting this on RMAC website too.

One-page Informational Sheet on Prescribed Herbivory

The RMAC and CWGA Targeted Grazing Committee worked together to produce an informational sheet on prescribed herbivory for fuels reduction to potentially include in CAL FIRE’s guidance on fuel reduction treatment activities. Because CAL FIRE has not provided further guidance on next steps, the RMAC decided to request permission to independently publish and disseminate the information. The Board of Forestry & Fire Protection (‘Board’) unanimously voted to approve this motion at it’s March 6th meeting.

Member Delbar asked if there was a timeline from CAL FIRE for reviewing the timeline, and if/what their resistance to publication was. Dr. Wolf indicated that the RMAC has not received any feedback around any potential resistance to publication, nor any information on a potential timeline for review or future discussion. Dr. Wolf suggested that someone from the RMAC could bring this topic back up at a Board meeting to inquire as to what next steps might be.

Approximate start time on video recording: 00:22:00

3. Approval of Sept 2023 and Jan 2024 meeting minutes – Dr. Wolf, Board Staff

The draft September meeting minutes were lost during a computer file transition; Dr. Wolf will attempt to recover them, and if that is not possible, will redraft them for review at a future meeting. The January 2024 minutes were sent out to the RMAC members for their review prior to the meeting.

Discussion

Member Cremers noted that there was a typo in the meeting minutes, and that Member Hagata is stepping down this summer. Dr. Wolf will make that correction.

Member Soares motioned to approve the January 2024 meeting minutes with the above correction; Member Cremers seconded the motion. There was no additional discussion.

Roll Call Vote:

Rich Ross	Absent at time of vote
Joel Kramer	Aye
Cole Bush	Aye
Bart Cremers	Aye
Dr. Paul Starrs	Aye
Andrée Soares	Aye
Lance Criley	Absent (virtual only)
Dr. Stephanie Larson	Aye
Taylor Hagata	Absent
OPEN SEAT	N/A
Dr. Marc Horney	Aye

Action Item:

- The motion passes unanimously; the meeting minutes are posted online: [January 16, 2024 Meeting Minutes](#).

Approximate start time on video recording: 00:14:00

4. Expiring Member Terms and New Member Nomination(s): Discussion and recommendations for appointment or reappointment to the RMAC – Dr. Wolf, Board Staff

- The reappointment of Member Ross, and reappointments to positions for Chair (Dr. Horney) and Vice-Chair (Dr. Larson), were unanimously approved at the March 6th Board meeting.
- Member Roney will not continue in her seat after expiration of her term this month; Member Hagata will step down after expiration of his term in June. Both seats are statutorily to be filled by individuals nominated by organizations representing rangeland owners.
- Potential Applicants should be nominated by an organization representing rangeland owners, and nominations can be made using the Nomination Form.

Resources

- [RMAC Membership and Terms](#)
- [RMAC Call for Applications](#)
- [RMAC Member Nomination Form](#)

Action Items

- One seat remains open, and a second will expire in June 2024; if the RMAC has nominees, they will be reviewed at the next RMAC meeting after applications/nominations are received.
- Nominees, if any, may submit a Letter of Interest and CV to Dr. Wolf via email. Nominating Organizations may submit nominations to Dr. Wolf via [email](#) using the following template: [RMAC Member Nomination Form](#)
- Member Kramer will reach out to potential applicants.
- Member Soares' reappointment will be voted on at the Board's April meeting.

Approximate start time on video recording: 00:29:40

5. **2023 Annual Report and Workplan and 2024 Annual Priorities** – Dr. Horney, Chair; Dr. Wolf, Board Staff; and RMAC members

2024 Annual Priorities

- Dr. Wolf indicated that all previously submitted feedback from stakeholders and agencies has been incorporated, and she worked with Chair Dr. Horney and Vice-Chair Dr. Larson to revise the 2024 Annual Priorities. The revised version was shared with the RMAC members for additional input, and none was received.
- Dr. Wolf noted that the 2024 annual priorities are ultimately embedded in the 2023 Annual Report and Workplan, and the finalized priorities and the workplan are sent to the Board for its approval.
- Dr. Wolf noted that there was one comment from the Natural Resources Agency that was not incorporated, as there was no clear direction about how the edit should be made, and no additional input was provided by members on how to incorporate the comment.

2023 Annual Report and Workplan

Dr. Wolf shared that two committee members provided input into her draft of the report, and she has incorporated those suggestions.

Resources

- [5. DRAFT 2024 RMAC Objectives-Assignments w Comments](#)
- [5. DRAFT 2024 RMAC Objectives-Assignments TC w Comments](#)

- [5. RMAC 2023 Annual Report and Workplan DRAFT w Comments](#)
- [5. RMAC 2023 Annual Report and Workplan DRAFT TC w Comments](#)

Discussion

Member Soares stated that she believes this report is in a state that is ready to move along to the Board.

Member Soares motioned to approve the 2024 Annual Priorities and 2023 Annual Report and Workplan as presented. Member Starrs seconded the motion.

Member Cremers noted the outstanding comment mentioned by Dr. Wolf. Dr. Wolf noted that the California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) has not yet responded to inquiries regarding Overarching Priority IV regarding the CDFA Noxious Weeds Program (NWP). Dr. Horney suggested that to minimize additional work regarding approval of these documents, a note within the report could be made regarding the unclear status of the NWP.

Member Soares motioned again to approve the 2024 Annual Priorities and 2023 Annual Report and Workplan with the addition of the aforementioned note. Member Starrs seconded the motion.

Roll Call Vote:

Rich Ross	Absent at time of vote
Joel Kramer	Aye
Cole Bush	Aye
Bart Cremers	Aye
Dr. Paul Starrs	Aye
Andrée Soares	Aye
Lance Criley	Absent (virtual only)
Dr. Stephanie Larson	Aye
Taylor Hagata	Absent
OPEN SEAT	N/A
Dr. Marc Horney	Aye

Action Item:

- The motion passes unanimously; the Annual Report and Workplan, along with embedded Annual Priorities are posted online: [2023 Annual Report and Workplan - 2024 Annual Priorities](#)

Approximate start time on video recording: 00:39:30

6. Updates and Next Steps: Educational Workshop Series 2023/24 – Dr. Larson, Vice-Chair

Vice-Chair Dr. Larson reported that she and Member Cremers spoke about a focus on cattle, given that cattle producers may need additional information on targeted grazing with cattle, and not just sheep and goats. Dr. Larson is willing to organize the effort(s), but needs input on this, including on the timing of this. The RMAC received information that timing might be best for legislative aides if workshops are set in the late summer/early fall.

Discussion

Dr. Wolf noted that there are several examples where cattle are being utilized and integrated into grazing treatments for fuels reduction, including at East Bay Regional Parks District, and Dr.

Larson indicated Member Cremers also had some examples. Member Cremers noted that summer/fall could be a difficult time for cattle producers, and that the target species/ecosystem services might also not be highlighted well at that time. Vice-Chair Dr Larson agreed that this is a good point. Other members also agreed with this reasoning. Dr. Horney noted Ben Munger is doing work on the Carrizo Plains around this. Chair Dr. Horney also noted that while folks on the small ruminant side are generally well-versed in this topic, but many cattle ranchers may not be. Dr. Larson and Dr. Horney noted it would be good to have a multi-species perspective. Dr. Larson noted that the goats and sheep may be used as a shorter-term action, followed by longer-term management solution with cattle to maintain fuel removal/reduction. Other applications include grazing of vernal pools, fire-fuels reduction, special-status species, and more. The audience could be agency personnel, and beyond. Tim Koopman was indicated as a possible contact, as he manages state park land for fire and habitat. Member Kramer noted that a rancher at Rancho Corte Madera is working with University of New Mexico on investigating virtual fencing options, given that is often a limiting factor around targeted grazing.

Dr. Wolf mentioned the possibility of a webinar laying the groundwork for a workshop(s) and could be done before the workshops, and include a primer on grazing with more information on a variety of topics, ecosystems, purposes, and more, which would then be followed by one or two in-person context- and site-specific workshops. Member Dr. Starrs noted that resource managers on public lands are often lacking knowledge about livestock grazing for reducing fire hazard and enhancing public land access and environment, and thus it could be worth having a portion of this seminar about using livestock for improving conditions in managed lands. Dr. Larson mentioned bringing CAL FIRE into these discussions as well.

Action Items:

- Send suggestions for locations, speakers, and organizations to Dr. Larson, Dr. Horney, and Dr. Wolf at Kristina.wolf@bof.ca.gov, slarson@ucanr.edu, and mhorney@calpoly.edu by the end of March.
- Chair Dr. Horney also mentioned the integration of prescribed grazing with other fuels treatments activities, and that he has a student that might be willing to work on this. All RMAC members and/or stakeholders (audience members) can reach out to Dr. Horney with information on any of these kinds of practices (mhorney@calpoly.edu) (information about wherever this has happened –where, when, how, why, etc, so that these outcomes can be added into the technical guide and white paper update).

Time: 01:20:00

7. Updates and Next Steps: Prescribed Herbivory Deliverables – Dr. Wolf, Board staff

Resources:

[Prescribed Herbivory for Fuels Reduction Fact Sheet](https://bof.fire.ca.gov/media/hvphzp0q/7-prescribed-herbivory-fuels-reduction-guidance.png)
(<https://bof.fire.ca.gov/media/hvphzp0q/7-prescribed-herbivory-fuels-reduction-guidance.png>)

Dr. Wolf summarized the background on this item: Several RMAC members and members of the California Woolgrowers Association (CWGA) Targeted Grazing Committee produced this one-page fact sheet with the hope that it would be put into CAL FIRE's Fuels Reduction Guidance. No agreement was reached about how or if CAL FIRE or the Board will utilize this document. The RMAC voted at the January meeting to approve for independent publication by the CWGA/RMAC team, and the Board unanimously approved this at the March Board meeting.

Action:

Dr. Wolf has been working with Member Bush and Roger Ingram at CWGA to ensure final proper credits for authors and artwork/pictures and will work to finalize the document and send out for dissemination.

Prescribed Herbivory 2015 White Paper Update

Member Bush reported that the CWGA Targeted Grazing Committee is eager to support this effort. Dr. Wolf reported that the initial revised version from Member Bush was sent out to the RMAC members with a request for feedback, and those edits were incorporated and sent back to Member Bush and the RMAC members for review prior to this meeting. Member Bush and Dr. Wolf noted that there is a LOT of information that is still needed on this document, especially updated examples of how contracts are being written today, insurance certificates, new CEQA (California Environmental Quality Act, environmental compliance documentation) examples, and other relevant resources, particularly with information from a cattle lens.

Member Bush suggested this version be sent to the CWGA team WHILE RMAC members are sending in edits/revisions. Dr. Wolf indicated that simultaneous work by the CWGA and RMAC could help turn this around sooner, followed by a public comment period; this keeps the timeline tight and clear, and allows feedback from all stakeholders across California. Member Starrs noted that the core pages of the document are only 8 pages long, and that this seems manageable. Dr. Larson noted that getting information beyond prescribed herbivory around other fuels treatments would be a good idea; Dr. Wolf noted that this was one of the original intentions of this paper, and we need more input on that topic, and she would not consider it complete without that information.

Focusing solely on prescribed herbivory for the purposes of this white paper, rather than integrating other fuels treatment activities, was mentioned by Dr. Horney and Member Bush, with the idea of adding in additional treatments in a future version (next year), with an effort to add case studies and more information to expand on this for next year. Member Starrs noted that since 2015 there have been some rather epic fire management catastrophes, and it seems that in the last ten years the RMAC has become more aware of the issue and a more effective approach is needed. He also noted that this document won't require a huge brochure or effort for dissemination; we can focus on this being disseminated online instead. Dr. Wolf noted that if the RMAC focuses solely on prescribed herbivory for fuels management for now, with additional information on integrated fuels treatments next year, that would at least be a good interim step. Dr. Horney noted that a focus on expanding the evidence around grazing as a tool to reduce fire fuels would be helpful for now, along with other evidence that other fuels treatments integrated into a fuels management plan that includes prescribed herbivory can improve the outcome, but the focus on HOW this occurs would go into the technical guidance document (see below).

Action Items:

- The RMAC members and CWGA Targeted Grazing Committee will provide revisions to this document, information for the appendices, and examples/case studies to Dr. Wolf via email by **May 19, 2024**.
- Dr. Horney will solicit graduate students to help with the literature review as well. Dr. Horney will send out a link with a folder to add in resources. He will also invite other colleagues to recruit other students and academics to help with this process.

Prescribed Herbivory Technical Guidance

At the meeting before last it was decided that the items being covered by other guides in production by the NSA and SRM should be reviewed before delving too far into this effort. Member Cole was mentioned as having connections to the NSA, and could make that inquiry.

Time: 01:48:15

8. State Lands Grazing License & Land Management (SLGLLM) sub-Committee Deliverables –
Bart Cremers, *Member*

Dr. Wolf introduced the agenda item and summarized the discussion from the January meeting: Previous plans to create sample grazing agreements and/or grazing management plans using the templates in development will no longer move forward so as to avoid potential confusion or perceptions about constraints for using these templates. As such, we will return focus to the production and finalization of the Guidance Booklet, which is intended to walk users through the utilization of the Grazing Agreement template and the Grazing Management Plan templates being developed by this committee; the bulk of these templates were produced by the SLGLLM subcommittee, which has since been dissolved as these deliverables approach finalization.

Member Cremers noted that the agreement and management plan templates are relatively complete at this point, and are in Dr. Horney and Dr. Wolf's hands to finalize. He started on the guidance booklet and will continue on that to hopefully have a draft by the next meeting.

Time: 1:52:00

9. Collaborations with Working Groups or Advised Agencies – Dr. Wolf, *Board staff*

Natural & Working Lands (NWL) Science Team – Dr. Wolf noted that she attended the meeting yesterday to discuss the different land cover type maps being created to support information in the NWL Climate Smart Strategies Update, CARB Scoping Plan, and the upcoming CA Climate Change Assessment. Dr. Wolf has been sharing information to the listservs about opportunities for involvement and public input. If individuals would like to be included on the listserv, please email Kristina.wolf@bof.ca.gov.

Member Kramer noted that he had received feedback from stakeholders that some of the mapping for agricultural lands were inaccurate. He reached out to CNRA within the comment period and suggested that they subdivide the polygons and verify with the land manager to clarify dominant treatment for the polygon.

Time: 1:57:30

10. Updates from Partner Organizations & Public Forum

a. Legislative Updates

None provided.

b. Updates from Partner Organizations

Member Kramer provided an update from the RCD of Greater San Diego:

- They are seeing non-profit partners hiring more at regional level for ranching and conservation ranching, including Audubon and Point Blue.
- The RCD was successful in getting funding from the Department of Conservation for a prescribed grazing project in Alpine, which is at higher elevation than most other areas in San Diego County. This will be a nice

comparison of grazing outcomes to those in the lower elevation, more coastal climates.

- Healthy Soils funding is active right now with block grant funding. More opportunities for carbon sequestration are now available on larger properties. However, a lot of ranchers are running into limits because a Grazing Management Plan is required to do prescribed grazing with internal fencing, and there isn't designated funding for perimeter fencing from any state or other sources.
- The National Association of Conservation Districts had their annual conference this year, and many local ranches were included on the field tours.
- **Upcoming Event** – there are multiple upcoming Women in Ranching Educational Development (WIRED) events:
<https://www.womeninranching.co/calendar>
 - One is occurring at Camp Marsten in Julian and will be hosted by local cattlemen. All events are listed here: <https://www.ancw.org/Events>. All are welcome. Details: Sept 28-29; attendees have requested guidance about estimating forage and grazing management plans, which are things that CRMs specialize in, in addition to the usual topics like disease and pest management.

c. Members of the public may address the Committee on any topic within its jurisdiction not otherwise on the agenda. Items will not be discussed in depth but may be agendaized for the next committee meeting.

Time: 2:03:30

11. Announcements, next meeting date, agenda items

The next RMAC meeting will be Tuesday, May 21, 2024 at 12:30 PM in Sacramento, CA.